Contents

Introduction xvii

CHAPTER ONE  Textualism and Its Canons  1
   I. Defining Textualism  1
   II. The Allure of Textualism  2
   III. Some Basic Canons of Textualism  5
      A. The Constitutional Text should not be given
         a Strict Construction  6
      B. The Constitutional Text should be given its
         Plain Meaning  10
      C. Understanding Legal Terms of Art  14
      D. Ambiguous Language and Multiple
         Meanings  18
      E. The Text should be Read to Avoid Surplus
         and Redundancy  21
      F. A Negative Inference can be drawn from
         Affirmative Text  23
      G. Exceptions Define the Extent of Power  26
      H. The Court should Focus on the Precise
         Words of the Text and not some Paraphrased
         Alternative  27

CHAPTER TWO  Intratextualism and Textual Purpose  31
   I. Intratextualism—Using the Text to Read
      the Text  31
      A. Usage within the Constitution  31
      B. Usage in Context  34
      C. Congruence with Other Clauses  36
CHAPTER THREE  Original Understanding: Preconstitutional Sources and the Drafting and Ratification Process  57

I. What Is Original Understanding?  57

II. Preconstitutional History and Sources  59

A. English History  59
C. Blackstone's Commentaries on the Law of England  69
D. Colonial History  71
E. Declaration of Independence  72
F. Articles of Confederation and Experience Thereunder  72
G. The Virginia Experience and the Religion Clauses  75

III. Drafting and Ratification of the Constitution and its Amendments  78

A. Statements and Debate during the Drafting Process  79
B. Changes in the Text during the Drafting Process  81
C. The Significance of Rejected Provisions  82
D. Understanding during the Ratification Process  85
E. Absence of Discussion  88
F. The Federalist Papers  89
CHAPTER FOUR  Original Understanding: Contemporaneous Understanding and Interpretive Issues  93

I. Contemporaneous Practice and Understanding 93
   A. Contemporaneous Dictionaries and Other Writings 93
   B. Pre- and Post-Ratification State Constitutions 95
   C. Contemporaneous State Practice 97
   D. Contemporaneous Congressional Practice 99
   E. Early Congressional and Executive Practice 101
   F. Contemporaneous Judicial Understanding 104
   G. Prominent Framers and Sources 106

II. Interpretive Issues Regarding Original Understanding 113
    A. Unsourced Original Understanding 113
    B. Original Understanding to Illuminate Purpose 114
    C. Dueling Histories 117
    D. Revising History 122
    E. Original Understanding as a Method of Exclusion 123
    F. Inconclusive Original Understanding 124
    G. Broad Principle v. Specific Conceptions 126
    H. Taking Account of Change 129
    I. Unacceptable Outcomes 131

III. Conclusion 131

CHAPTER FIVE  Tradition and Practice  133

I. Introduction 133

II. Long and Continuous Federal Executive or Legislative Practice 134
    A. Practices Extending to the Time of the Framing 134
B. Separation of Powers and Congressional Practice 137

C. Serious Legislative or Executive Consideration 139

III. Long-standing Practice and the Establishment Clause 140

IV. Tradition and the "Public Forum" Doctrine 144

V. Tradition and Practice and Due Process 146
   A. Tradition and Incorporation 147
   B. Tradition and Substantive Due Process
      Liberty 149

VI. Reliance on International Practice 154

VII. Level of Generality 155

VIII. Evolving Standards—The "Living" Constitution 158

IX. Change, Decline, and Absence of Tradition and Practice 161
   A. Insufficient Length to a Practice 161
   B. Deliberate Change to Legislative Practice 162
   C. Declining Legislative or Judicial Practice 162
   D. The Absence of Practice 164

X. Evaluating Tradition 165

XI. Conclusion 166

CHAPTER SIX Structural Reasoning 169

I. Nature of Structural Reasoning 169

II. Classic Structural Arguments 170
   A. Marbury v. Madison 170
   B. Martin v. Hunter's Lessee 171
   C. McCulloch v. Maryland 171

III. Big Picture Structure 173

IV. Deriving Structural Arguments 177
   A. Structure and Original Understanding 177
   B. Structure on its Own—The Eleventh Amendment Cases 179
   C. Structure and Purpose 182
   D. Structure by Contrast 183
V. Structure and Judicial Review 184
VI. Structure and Rights 190
VII. Structure and Separation of Powers 191
VIII. Structure v. Structure 196
IX. Conclusion 202

CHAPTER SEVEN  Precedent 205
I. Introduction 205
II. Developing Precedent—The Exclusionary Rule 206
III. Interpreting and Shaping Precedent 211
   A. Understanding Precedent 211
   B. Expanding Precedent 212
   C. Understanding Precedent Based on its Facts 218
   D. Unique Precedent 219
   E. Narrowing Precedent 222
   F. Precedent and Analogy 222
   G. The Weight of Precedent 225
   H. Dicta 227
IV. Distinguishing Precedent 230
   A. Precedent Undermined by Subsequent Cases 231
   B. Factual and Legal Distinctions 232
V. Overruling Precedent 237
   A. Reconsideration of Constitutional Precedent 237
   B. Departure from Established Doctrine 240
   C. Abandoned Precedent 241
   D. Rejecting the Underlying Predicates 242
   E. Changed Facts or Circumstances 244
   F. Reliance Interest 246
   G. Unworkability 248
   H. Comparison to Other Overruled Decisions 250
   I. Incorrectly Decided 251
   J. Ill-Considered Precedent 253
   K. Precedent Unsupported by Other Sources 254
CHAPTER EIGHT Deriving Doctrine 257

I. Introduction 257

II. Deriving Principle 258
   A. Freedom of Speech Principle 259
   B. Equal Protection and Racial Discrimination 263
   C. One Person One Vote 267
   D. The Right to an Abortion 269
   E. Principle v. Principle 270

III. From Principle to Doctrine—The Establishment Clause 271
     A. The Wall of Separation 271
     B. The Lemon Test 274

IV. Deriving Doctrine 277
    A. The Search for Intermediate Principles 277
    B. Doctrine from Dissent—Seditious Speech 278
    C. Doctrine by Blueprint—Strict Scrutiny 281
    D. Doctrine as Reconciliation—Free Speech and Libel 285
    E. Doctrine by Accident—All Deliberate Speed 287

V. Sources of Doctrine 288
   A. Doctrine from Precedent 289
   B. Doctrine from Purpose 292
   C. Doctrine from Structure 295
   D. Doctrine from Necessity 296
   E. Doctrine from Theory 299
   F. Doctrine as Summary 300
   G. Borrowing Doctrine 301
   H. Doctrine from Whole Cloth 301

VI. Conclusion 305
CHAPTER NINE  Shaping, Clarifying, and Changing Doctrine  307

I. Introduction  307
II. Shaping Doctrine  307
   A. Defining the Issue  307
   B. Empirical Support for Doctrine  308
   C. The Impact of Doctrine  313
   D. Line Drawing  315
   E. Bright Lines  317
   F. Interest Balancing to Create Doctrine  321
   G. Anti-Doctrine—Ad Hoc Judgment  324
   H. Multifactor Tests  327
   I. Avoiding Evasion  329
   J. Implementing Doctrine Procedurally  330

III. Clarifying Doctrine  332
   A. Principled Application  332
   B. Doctrine in Flux  335
   C. Resolving Doctrinal Conflicts  336
   D. Justifying Doctrine  337
   E. Choice of Doctrine  337
   F. Cleaning up a Doctrinal Mess  338
   G. Changing Doctrine  344

IV. Conclusion  350

CHAPTER TEN  Consequential Reasoning  351

I. Introduction  351
II. Classic Consequential Arguments  352
III. Will the Bad Consequences Occur?  355
   A. Avoiding the Risk  355
   B. The Danger of Small Risks  355
   C. Remote Possibilities  356
   D. Proving Bad Consequences  358
IV. Can the Court Prevent Bad Consequences from Occurring?  360
   A. Can a Principled Line be Drawn?  360
   B. Taking a Case-by-Case Approach  361
   C. The Inability to Impose Limits as a Decisive Factor  364
D. Bad Consequences for the Court and its Doctrine 366
V. Are the Consequences Really that Bad? 366
VI. Should the Possibility of Bad Consequences Influence the Decision? 367
VII. Bad Consequences as Rhetorical Argument 368
VIII. Conclusion 370

CHAPTER ELEVEN Ethical Argument 371
I. The Nature of Ethical Argument 371
II. Ethical Argument and Cruel and Unusual Punishment 372
   A. The Eighth Amendment and Evolving Standards 372
   B. The Death Penalty Cases 374
   C. The Length of Sentence Cases 386
III. Substantive Due Process Cases 389
   A. The Punitive Damage Cases 389
   B. The Due Process Privacy Cases 392
IV. One Person, One Vote 396
V. Ethical Argument Everywhere? 396

CHAPTER TWELVE Rhetoric in Constitutional Interpretation 399
I. Introduction 399
II. Rhetoric to Bolster Principle 399
   A. At the Outset—Marbury v. Madison 399
   B. First Amendment Classics 400
   C. The Rhetoric of Justice Jackson 404
III. Rhetoric to Emphasize Strength of Conviction 405
IV. Enduring Rhetoric 406
V. Metaphor 409
VI. Rhetoric in Dissent 411
VII. Ineffective Rhetoric 412
VIII. Rhetoric Wars 414
IX. Colorful Rhetoric 415
X. Conclusion 416
CHAPTER THIRTEEN  Synthesis 419

I.  *Cohens v. Virginia* 419
II. The *Slaughter-House Cases* 425
III. *Powell v. Alabama* 432
V. *Lee v. Weisman* 437

Notes 445
Table of Cases 541
Index 553