Index

Abortion, 31–32, 97, 151, 238–39, 240, 247, 269, 302–303, 394, 413
Blackmun's history of, 151
narrowing precedent in, 222
Accused, Sixth Amendment definition, 50–51
Affirmative Commerce Clause, 344–45
Alienage, 236–37, 349–50
Alien and Sedition Act, 435–36
Alito, Justice Samuel Anthony, Jr., 30, 385
Analogy and precedent, 222–23
company town as state, 223
Marsh v. Alabama as precedent, 223–24
public function doctrine, 223
Anti-Commandeering, 83, 90, 100, 109, 164, 182
Arrest, 67, 163
Articles of Confederation, 420–421
differences between Constitution and, 73
original understanding of, 59, 72–75
state orientation of, 424
Association, Right of, 292–93
Bad consequences argument
arbitrary rules, 361
avoiding risk, 355
burden of persuasion, 360
case-by-case approach and the, 361–64
Commerce Clause and, 354–55
common sense and, 357–58
dangers of, 365–57
drawing sensible lines, 361
effect on Court, 366
level of risks, 365
Marshall on Marbury v. Madison as classic, 352–53
power of, 353
proving, 358–60
reasonableness principle, 364
as rhetorical, 351–55, 368
slippery slope as a result of ruling, 360–66
Balancing of Interests
creating doctrine and, 321–24
Poe v. Ullman, 177

Basic canons of textualism
exceptions as one of the, 26
legal terms of art and, 14–17
plain meaning and, 10–13
strict constructionism and, 6–9
Big Picture structure
Columns v. Virginia, 173–74
federalism and state autonomy protection, 174
Fong Yue Ting v. United States, 174–75
foreign affairs power and, 177–78
Hamdi v. Rumsfeld, 178–79
in relationship between state and individual under Due Process Clause, 176
Texas v. White, 174
United States sovereignty and, 178
Bill of Attainder Clause, 14
Brown, United States v., 15–16
Cummins v. Missouri, 15
Ex parte Garland, 15
interpretation of, 15–16
limits on, 16
Lovett, United States v., 15
Nixon v. GSA, 16
Bill of Religious Liberty (Virginia), 75
and death penalty for polygamy under, 76
on applying Constitutional privacy
provisions in a modern world, 127
on curtailing civil rights, 283
on religious liberty, 115–16
Blackmun, Justice Harry Andrew, 32, 151, 158, 187, 248–49, 303, 365, 413–14
Blackstone's Commentaries. See Commentaries on the Law of England (Blackstone)
Blaine Amendment, 83
criticism of literal language approach to Constitutional interpretation, 8

553
INDEX

Brandes, Justice Louis (Cont'd) and unsourced original understanding, 115–14
deriving doctrine from precedent, 299–90
malice standard for defamation cases, 285–87
on purpose of constitutional language, 48–49
Breyer, Justice Stephen Gerald, 118, 324–25, 390
Capital punishment, 41. See also Death penalty
Cardozo, Justice Benjamin Nathan, 115, 361
cases undermined by precedent, 231
changed facts or circumstances, precedent overruled by, 244–46
Civil liberties
Magna Carta as foundation of, 61
Powell v. Alabama, 432–34
structural reasoning and, 190
Censorship as Establishment Clause violation, 439
Coke, Lord, 10, 66, 71
Colonial history and original understanding, 71–72
Commander-in-Chief clause, 42
Commentaries (Story), 110, 112, 128, 433
Commentaries on the Constitution. See Story, Justice Joseph
Common law
Commons on the Law of England (Blackstone), 69–71
as a historical secondary source, 70
importance of to framing generation, 71
affirmative, 344–46
bad-consequences argument and, 354–55
Congressional power boundary, 353–54
doctrinal shift, 344–46
dormant analysis and, 297–99
limits to, 291–93
Lopez, United States v., 246–47
Common law and constitutional interpretation, 5
as historical antecedent of Constitution, 60
original understanding of, 59
rule, rejected as intent of framing generation, 68
Congruence over time, 43–44
Establishment Clause and, 44
Congruence, textual, 36–43
Bill of Rights and, 38
capital punishment, 41
Coleman v. Virginia, 37–38
Commander-in-Chief clause, 42
courts, 38, 455r, 56
Commander-in-Chief clause, 42
Eighth Amendment and, 39
Privilege Against Self-Incrimination, 43
Pratt v. United States, 432
right to review, Supreme Court’s 37
in Wainwright v. Hackett, 41
Consequential arguments, 420, 421, 423
curtailment of, 360
Cooper v. Virginia, 121
Lee v. Weisman, 440
proving, 358–60
slippery slope toward pervasive trade regulation, 353
See also Bad-consequences argument
Consequential reasoning
abuse, potential, 363
avoiding risk, 355
common sense and, 357–58
danger of, 355
effect on Court, 366
influence of bad-consequences, 367–68
level of risks, 355–57
limits, inability to pose, 364–66
power of, 353
reasonableness principle, 364
as rhetorical, 351–55, 368
See also Bad-consequences argument
Constitutional Convention, speeches from, cited by Court, 79
Constitutionality tests, 321–32
Constitutional judicial review, structural argument as interpretive tool in, 170–71
Constitutional purpose
the accused, Sixth Amendment definition, 50–51
of Establishment Clause, 49
of Excessive Fines Clause, 50
of Fifteenth Amendment, 50
Flast v. Cohen, 49
of Fourteenth Amendment, 51
of Fourth Amendment, 48–49, 455r, 513
Gibbons v. Ogden, 45–46
Gravel v. United States, 47–48
Heater v. United States, 455r, 513
INDEX 555

Kentucky v. Denison, 46–47
McCollum v. Maryland, 46
Okanagan v. United States (Pocket Veto), 47
Olmstead v. United States, 48
Constitutional rights and structural arguments, 190–91

Constitutional text, absence of
in McCulloch v. Maryland, 52
in Nixon v. Fitzgerald, 52
in Ray v. Blair, 51
in Youngstown Sheet and Tube v. Sawyer, 52

Constitutional text, disregarding
Alden v. Maine, 53, 54
Eleventh Amendment, 53–54
Hans v. Louisiana, 53, 54
Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida, 53, 54
See also Eleventh Amendment

Contemporaneous congressional practice, 99–101
Contemporaneous State Practice, 97–99

Content, considering for Constitutional interpretation, 176
Contrasting language, 34
Cooley, Thomas, 112–13
Copyright Clause, 93, 137
language flexibility and, 8–9
Council of Revision, rejection of, citation of, 83

Cruel and unusual punishment provision, 23, 38, 41, 66, 112, 126, 154, 161, 163, 165, 231–32, 399, 368, 372–89

Contemporary American ethos and, 372
the death penalty, 374–86
the evolving standard, 372–74
Powell v. Texas, 217, 218
principles to assess, 374
Robinson v. California, 217, 218
sentence length, 372, 386–89
Wrenn v. United States, 372–73
See also Death penalty; Eighth Amendment

Danbury Baptist Association, Letter to
(Thomas Jefferson), 75–76, 116, 273, 409
Death penalty, See also Cruel and unusual punishment provision
accomplices and, 379–80
child rape and, 379, 384–86
Coker v. Georgia, 378–79
current American standards and, 375, 376, 377–78
as deterrence, 375
doubt concerning, 374
and Due Process clause, 231

Farman v. Georgia and, 374–77
Gregg v. Georgia and, 377–78
infrquent administration of, 374
judicial decisions versus societal attitudes, 375
for juveniles, 381–84
mental disability and, 380–81
precedent undermined in cases of, 231–32
rape and, 379
refinement on, 375
as retribution, 375
societal consensus and, 279–380
societal disapproval and, 377

Decisions using multiple interpretation methods
Cohens v. Virginia, 419–25
Lee v. Weisman, 437–43
Powell v. Alabama, 432–37
Declarations of Independence, 441
framers’ understanding of, 59, 72
and Slaughter-House Cases, 460n118

Deriving doctrine
borrowing of, 301
defined, 257
derivation of principle in, 258
disagreements over, 290–305
doctrinal sources, 289–308
the Fourteenth Amendment, 289
judicially manageable standards, 289–91
from necessity, 296–99
political question doctrine, 289–91
from precedent, 289–92
from purpose, 292–95
separation of powers and, 289–90, 295–96
from structure, 295–96
as summary, 300–301
from theory, 299–300
from whole cloth, 301–305
Dicta, holding and, 227–28

Doctrinal clarification, fundamental rights and suspect classification, 339–42

Doctrinal conflicts, resolving, 336–37, 350

Doctrinal framework. See Supreme Court, doctrinal framework of
Doctrinal rules, development of, 331
Doctrinal shift, example of, 344–45
Doctrinal sources, 289–308
Doctrine, borrowing, in First Amendment, 301

Doctrine, changing
Affirmative Commerce Clause, 344–45
aliens, discrimination against, 349–50
free exercise and the standards of review, 346–47
Doctrine, changing (Cont'd)
gender discrimination and, 347–48
standards of review, 347–48
Doctrine, development of, 315–21
ad hoc approach and, 316–27
clear, bright-line rules in developing, 317–21
line drawing in the development of, 315–17
naked balancing approach in. See Balancing of Interests
rules for, 331
tests to access constitutionality, 324–25
Doctrine, judicial/legal
anti-doctrine (ad hoc judgment), 324–27
balancing interests in creating, 321–24, 330
changing, 344–46
choice of, 337–38
clarifying, 332
defining which to apply, 307–308
definition, 205
empirical support for, 308–13
Establishment Clause and, 311, 314
evaluating, 314
in flux, 315–36
impact of, 313, 350
implementing rules of, 330–32
justifying, 337, 350
lack of evidence and, 411
mess, cleaning up, 338, 350
particularistic fact-oriented approach and, 325, 516n140
and principled boundaries, 316
rejection of, 250
shaping, 307–31
structural argument and, 170
unworkability of, 249
Douglas, Justice William O., 213, 273, 283, 356, 394, 414, 415
Drafting of Constitution and Amendments, 78–79
Bill of Rights intended to apply to states, 80
changes in text during, 81–85
convention, original understanding of members, 59
rejected provisions, significance of, 82–85
statements and debate during, 79–81
Due process
abortion and, 394–95
arbitrariness of, 389–91
assisted suicide and, 395–96
background assumptions for meaning of liberty concept, 176
Clause, 32
disproportionality and, 390–91
divided societal issues and, 394–95
Duncan v. Louisiana, 228–29
Eighth Amendment and, 389–91
evolutionary approach to meaning of, 17
evolution of, 166
Excessive Fines Clause, 389–91
fairness and, 389–92
in Fifth Amendment, 16–18, 40, 432
historical standards and, 17, 390–91
history and, 393–94
homoerosexuality and, 395
jurisdictional comparative approach and, 390
legal standards and, 390
liberty and level of generality, 155–56
Murray v. Holmes Land Co, 16–17
open-ended nature of, 392
Poe v. Griswold, 393–94
privacy and, 392–96
and procedural limitations, 392
punitive damages and, 389
right to contract doctrine; rejection of, 243
in Sixth Amendment, 433
Skinner v. Oklahoma and, 392–93
societal norms and, 390–94
substantive due process; liberty and tradition, 149–54
and substantive limitations, 392
tradition and, 392–94
tradition and practice, defined by, 134
tradition-based analysis in, 146–47, 149
Tweener v. New Jersey, 17
underlying predicates, rejection of, 242–44
See also Fourteenth Amendment; Substantive Due Process
Economic reliance, See Reliance interest
Eighth Amendment
congruence; textual, 39
cruel and unusual punishment, 41, 66, 231–32, See also Cruel and unusual punishment provision; Death penalty evolving; Constitution approach under, 161
Excessive Fines Clause, 389–91, See also Punitive damages
probating death sentence for murder accomplice, 379–80
Alden v. Maine, 53, 54, 179–82
Chisholm v. Georgia, 54
Eleventh Amendment Cases and structural argument, 179–82
Hans v. Louisiana, 53, 54
INDEX 557

Marshall, Chief Justice John, on meaning of 16
See also Constitutional text, disregarding
English Bill of Rights, 66, 89
English historical antecedents
original understanding of, 61
Speech and Debate Privilege modeled on, 62
warning of placing too much weight on, 59–60
English incidents used by Supreme Court
Boyd v. United States, 63
Eckert v. Carrington, 63
Powell v. McCormack, 62–63
Tally v. California, 63–64
English Speech and Debate Privilege, 66
Equal protection principle
color-blind theory and, 266
and racial discrimination, 265
Equal protection theory, 221
Established doctrine, departure from
in Hammer v. Dagenhart, 240
in Metro Broadcasting v. F.C.C., 240
challene in McGowan v. Maryland, 77–78
changes to doctrine of, 243
coercion and, 439
Everson v. School Board, 140
first Supreme Court case of, 76–77
historical scholarship and purpose of, 440
juxtaposure of in synthesis, 65, 441
Lee v. Weisman, 437–43
Lemon test, 271–77
lengthy practice and tradition under, 143
released time law and, 273
and reliance interest, 248
religious persecution and adoption of, 76
violation of, in absence of coercion, 440
"wall of separation" and, 271–74
Ethical argument
Bowers v. Hardwick, 395
concept of, 371
cruel and unusual punishment, 371–89
due process and, 371–72, 389–96
inappropriate, 395–96
Lawrence v. Texas, 395
one person, one vote, 395
subjectivity of, 396
Evading doctrinal rules, 329–30
Evolving constitution, 158–61
Evolving standards
American ethos and, 372, 373
cruel and unusual punishment, 372
degrees of culpability and, 373
evolutionary approach to, 159
status versus conduct, 373–74
world ethos and, 373
Excessive Fines Clause, 50, 89, 389
Exclusionary rule
Boyd v. United States, 206
Calandra, United States v., 209
cost-benefit analysis of, 210
Hudson v. Michigan, 210
Leon, United States v., 210
Linkletter v. Walker, 206
Mapp v. Ohio, 207, 208, 253
precedents and, 206–11
and privacy protection, 206–207, 209
Stone v. Powell, 209–10
Weks v. United States, 206–207
Wolf v. Colorado, 207, 208, 244
Executive practice
and constitutional scrutiny by the Court, 139
historical practice of executive branch, 138
Ex Post Facto Clause, 14–15, 95, 118, 301
Extradition Clause, 46–47, 74, 111
Federal executive or legislative practice, extending to time of framing, 134–37
Federalism, structural argument as political safeguard of, 173, 184. See also Political safeguards theory
Federalist Papers, 70, 79, 109, 179, 424, 425
as source for original understanding, 59, 89–92
Federal spending programs and Establishment Clause, 235
taxpayer challenges to, 235
Field, Justice Stephen Johnson, 25, 80, 101, 429–30
Fifteenth Amendment, 50, 126–29
First Amendment, 301, 303–304
freedom of speech principle, 259
limiting Common Law of Libel, 434, 436
obscene material, possession of versus public distribution, 233–34
personal liberties, 216–17
picket, right to, 223–24
and racial segregation, 245
Religion Clauses of, 440
First Amendment (Contd)
religious literature distribution in company
  town and, 223
  and state educational policies, 251
  violations of, 216–17
Fourteenth Amendment, 32, 80, 88, 100, 115,
  130, 148, 189, 302, 303–304, 328, 339,
  426–32
  constitutional purpose, 51
  contention over meaning of, 13–14
  dicta in Washington v. Davis, 228
  Due Process Clause of, 16–18, 428, 430,
  432–34
  due process liberty under, 242
  Duncan v. Louisiana, 228–29
  Equal Protection under, 263–67, 428
  incorporation of Bill of Rights in, 225–26
  original understanding of, 429
  and plain meaning in Constitutional text,
  12–13
  preceding amendments granting due
  process, 432–33
  Privileges or Immunities Clause, 232, 427–32
  school prayer on ratification day, 442
  Slaughter-House Case opinions and, 425–32
  strict scrutiny and, 281–85
Fourth Amendment, 32, 43, 62, 67, 83, 127, 128,
  137, 160, 186, 218, 222, 228, 303–304, 309,
  317, 318–19, 346, 368, 407–408
  constitutional purpose, 48–49
  drafting of, affecting Puyallup v. New York, 82
  exclusionary rule, 206, 207, 209, 210
  and guarantee against unreasonable
  searches and seizures, 243–44
  and interest balancing, 321–23
  language flexibility and, 8
  Olmstead v. United States, 8
Framing generation
  Constitution drafters at Philadelphia
  Convention, 58
  context and practices of as precedent, 441
  English incidents used by Court of, 62–63
  important elements of understanding, 59
  Reconstruction era Congress, 58
  rejection of common-law rule, as intent of, 68
  See also Prominent framers of the
  Constitution
Frankfurter, Justice Felix, 29, 49, 65, 69, 80, 95,
  114, 142, 159, 165, 272, 281, 283, 290,
  368, 409
  on accepted practice, 138
  arguing for judicial candor and restraint, 324
  arguing for approaches that can be applied
  in a principled manner, 332
  on authority of Court decisions, 225–26
  on continuous changes of Court
direction, 237
  on fundamental fairness and jury size, 17–18
  on Marshall, Justice John, 7
  on meaning of Bill of Attainder Clause, 15
  Freedom of expression, liberty theory, 260.
  See also Freedom of speech
  Freedom of Press, 23, 68, 107, 164, 190–91, 232,
  270, 292
  Freedom of religion, coercive pressure in prayer
  at school, 438
  Freedom of speech, 64, 69, 71, 95, 113–14, 159,
  165, 216, 218, 220, 251, 259–60, 261–63,
  278–81, 296, 308, 310–11, 314, 321, 328,
  359, 412
  Alien and Sedition Act, limiting, 436
  Brandeis's rhetoric in Whitney v. California,
  402–406
  emotive function of speech and, 263
  First Amendment and, 259
  Holmes's rhetoric in Schenck v. United States,
  400–401
  impact of speech on citizen, 261
  Jackson's rhetoric in West Virginia Board of
  Education v. Barnette, 404–405
  Meiklejohn theory of, 435
  New York Times v. Sullivan, doctrinal
  framework in, 434–37
  offensive words and, 262–63
  principles of, versus freedom of religion
  principles, 438
  two-tier theory, 263
  unpopular speech and, 259–63
  Free Exercise Clause, 13, 75, 98, 118, 234, 253,
  254, 336–47, 364
  Church of Lukumi Babalu Aye v. City of
  Hialeah, 253
Fundamental fairness approach and tradition,
  147, 148
  Gender discrimination, 347–49
  Generality, level of
  and Due Process liberty, 156
  and tradition, 155
  Gerrymandering, judicial review of political,
  and unworkability, 249
  Goldberg, Justice Arthur Joseph, 25, 92, 110,
  117, 362
  Hamilton, Alexander, 108–9, 179
  Harlan, Justice John Marshall (elder), 264
  Harlan, Justice John Marshall (younger), 78, 79,
  88, 117, 130, 149, 150–51, 162, 208, 214,
Juveniles
culpability and, 382–83
minimum age, 382–84
societal consensus and, 382–84

Kennedy, Justice Anthony
McLeod, 32, 54, 118, 120, 146, 181–82, 189, 197–98, 247, 292, 311–12, 335, 457–59
and constitutional structure, 199–201

Language
arriving at decisions about ambiguous, 20–21
flexibility of Constitutional, 7–10
Legal distinction. See Doctrine, development of, line drawing in the development of
Legal tender, 25, 251–52
Legislative practice
constitutional scrutiny of, and the Court, 139
declining, 162–64
Legislative process, 43, 83, 111, 116, 139, 201, 384, 359
Legislative veto, 26, 79
Length of sentences. See Sentence length
Letter to Citizens of Quebec (Continental Congress), 71
Libel, law of, 104, 285–87, 310, 313, 434–37
defense of truth and, 436
New York Times v. Sullivan and freedom of
speech and, 434–37
public official plaintiff, 436
“Living Constitution,” evolving standards in, 138–61

Madison, James
81, 92, 102, 110, 116, 117, 122, 128, 441
Establishment Clause, 107–109
Freedom of Religion, 75–77
Magna Carta, 16, 60–61
Marketplace of ideas, skepticism grounded in, 259

Marshall, Chief Justice John
31, 34, 51, 69, 72, 74, 100, 101, 105, 113, 127, 130, 136, 139,
187–88, 196, 227, 300, 355, 361, 399, 419–25
on ambiguous language and multiple meanings, 18
and Article I, 26–27
and bad consequences argument, 352–53
Barrow v. City of Baltimore, 38
Cherokee Nation v. Georgia, 38–39
Cohens v. Virginia, 37–38
and congruence, textual, 43–44
and drawing inferences, 23–25
on Eleventh Amendment meaning, 16
and Federalist Papers, 89–90
Frankfurter, Justice Felix, on, 7
on interpreting the Constitution, 2–4
and judicial review, 170–71, 172–73
on plain meaning in Constitutional text, 10–11
and ratification process, 85–86
setting tone for subsequent interpretation, 7
on “strict construction,” 6–7
and structural arguments, 183–84
See also Marshall Court
Marshall Court, xvi–xviii, xx–xxi
textualism and, 5
Marshall, Justice Thurgood, 211–12, 375
and Equal Protection, 339–41
Memento and Remonstrance, 75, 76–77, 102,
107, 128, 440–41
Mental disability
morality and, 381
societal consensus and, 380–81
societal values and, 380–81
Metaphor as rhetorical device, 409–11
Everett v. Board of Education, used in, 409
Method of Exclusion, 123–24
Methods of constitutional interpretation. See also
Methods of interpretation
Methods of interpretation. See also
Consequential arguments; Originalism,
Rhetorical arguments; Structural arguments; Textualism
Military tribunals, 26, 251
Miller, Justice Samuel Freeman, on meaning of Bill of Attainder Clause, 15, 435–29
Modalities of constitutional argument
doctrinal. See Deriving doctrine
ethical. See Ethical argument
historical. See Preconstitutional history and sources; Revisionist history. See also Due
due process; history and
rhetoric; structure, and consequences, 420–421
structural. See Structural arguments;
Structural reasoning
structural reasoning as, 171–202
Supreme Court’s doctrinal framework as, 350
textual. See Textualism; Textual understanding
tradition and practice as, 133–67
Motive, propriety of, in bill of attainder
claims, 232
Multifactor doctrinal tests, 327–29. See also
Constitutionality tests
Necessary and Proper Clause, and structural reasoning, 5, 172
Necessary, constitutional definition, 31
in Public Use Clause, 451n6
Necessity
competing interests and, 296
Dormant Commerce Clause and, 297–99
Due Process and, 296
lack of, 296–97
wartime executive authority and, 296–97
Ninth Amendment, 22, 25, 92, 110, 117, 214
Nixon, President Richard, and Bill of Attainder Clause, 16

Obscene material, 95, 309, 325, 329
doctrinal confusion and, 342–44
Paris Adult Theatre v. SMSAm, 233–34
privately possessed and First Amendment rights, 233
public distribution of, 233–34
Reidel v. United States, 233
Stanley v. Georgia, 233
and Constitutional purpose, 182–83
One person, one vote, 296
Original intent, distinction from original understanding and the Court, 58
Originalism. See also Original understanding
defined, 57
drafting of the constitution and, 79–82
historical, preconstitutional sources of, 57–59, 62, 64–66, 70, 74
issues raised by, 58
ratification of the constitution and, 85
Originalist sources, 94
Original understanding, 91–132
basic assumption of, 57
broad principle of, 126–29
burden of proof the, and, 120
as challenge to precedent, 440
civil liberties, of, 61
Coke's Institutes and, 71
Communities on the Law of England (Blackstone), 69–71
common law and, 60
congressional practice and, 99–104
Cooley, Thomas and, 59, 112–13
distinction from original intent and the Court, 58
due process clause and, 98
endorsing as a methodology, 58
English case law effect on, 65
Establishment Clause and, 64, 115–16, 128, 131
executive practice and, 101–104
federal executive or legislative practice showing, 135
federalist papers the, and, 121, 424, 425
Fourteenth Amendment, 428, 430
freedom of speech clause and, 95–97
free exercise provision, 118
illuminating purpose of, 114–17
important elements of, 59
inconclusive, 124–26
Jefferson, Thomas and, 59, 109
judicial discretion and, 129–30
limits of, 125–26
Magna Carta and, 60
as method of exclusion, 123–24
presentment clause, 116–17
presidential immunity and, 120
of Privileges or Immunities Clause, 252
propriety of as method of constitutional interpretation, 58
and revisionist history, 122–23
in Slaughterhouse Cases, 126–29
societal changes and, 129–31
sources of, 58–59, 74, 81, 95–96
specific conception of, 126–29
Speech and Debate Clause and, 65–66
and Speedy Trial Guarantee, 71
stare decisis and, 122–23
Story, Joseph, and, 110–11
structural argument and, 170, 177, 194
Takings Clause and, 253
unacceptable outcomes of, 131
use in interpreting the constitution, 421
Philadelphia convention, draftsman at, 58
Plain meaning of Constitutional text, 10–14
ambiguous language and multiple meanings, 18–21
and comprehensive reading of the text, 13–14
continued use of, 12–13
differences of meaning under this approach, 13–14
justices' personal views and, 13
Plenary power, congressional
Champion v. Ames, 234
Hammer v. Dagenhart, 234
Political Question doctrine, 62, 289, 368–69
Political safeguards theory of federalism, 173, 187
viability of, 184–87
Population equality, the Constitution and, 396
Positive law, due process and, 147
Powell, Justice Louis Franklin, Jr., 187, 201, 265–66, 286, 310, 375, 379, 386–87
and precedent, 211–12
and strict scrutiny, 359–41
Practice
absence of, 164–65
cases decided by, 135–36
deliberate change to, 162
delaying legislative or judicial, 162–64
discarding precedent, 162–63
discussing, 104
Eveson v. School Board, 140
federal executive or legislative, 134–40
federal judicial, 134–40
of the first Congress, 136
insufficient length to, 161–62
international, reliance on, 154–55
legislative and executive, continuous, 137–39
of long standing, and the Establishment Clause, 140–44
of powers, 137–39
See also Religious practice; Tradition and practice
Precedent
abandoned, 241–42
Amalgamated Food Employees Union v. Logan Valley Plaza, 223–24
analogies and, 222–23
case law and, 46–47
cases that overruled, 250
case-by-case approach to, 250
creative use of, 213–15
defining, 205
development of, 206–11. See also Exclusionary rule
dicta, 227–30
distinguished, 230–31
factual and legal distinctions, 232–37
factual limitations of, 218–19
and Fourteenth Amendment, 289
and framing, context, and practices of, 441
and general power of, 212–13
difficulty in determining, 253–54
false, 125
false norms, 125
false premises, 125
false reliance, 125
false sources, 125
false statements, 125
false understandings, 125
false interpretations of, 125
false standards, 125
ill-considered, 253–54
incorrectly decided, 253–54
interpretation of, 217–18
judgmental overreach, 253–54
judicial review theory and, 259
Kern v. United States, 212–13
Lee v. Weisman, 440
limits of, expanding, 215–16
limits of the Commerce Clause, 291–92
Lloyd Corporation v. Tanner, 224
motivating the, 253
narrowing, 222
originalist challenge to, 440
originalist understanding of, 292
See also Established doctrine, departure from
plenary power, congressional, 234
and political question doctrine, 269–91
and reconsideration of, 237–40
and reliance interest, 246–48
and religious liberty, 223
and its own precedents, 224–26
and separationist approach, as 441
Slaughter-House Cases, 426–32
strict scrutiny and, 237, 238–39
structural argument and, 170
subsequent cases, undermining, 231–32
taxpayer standing and, 234–35
underlying predicates, rejection of, 242–44
undermined by extra-judicial sources, 254–55
understanding, 211–12
unique, 219–21
unsupported by other sources, 254
unworkability and, 248–50
weight of, 235–27
Preconstitutional history and sources, 59–60
English antecedents of Constitution, 59–60
Preamble Clause and concern about evasion of presidential signature, 79
Presidential immunity, 51, 110, 120, 194
Principle, deriving. See also individual principles
abortion and, 291–92
animal rights and, 290–91
coercing principles and, 270–71
conflict with law and, 253–54
cumulative process and, 254–55
cumulative weight and, 255
freedom of speech and, 259–63
marketplace of ideas and, 259
self-government, 259
Privacy protection, 206–207. See also Exclusionary rule
Grinnell v. United States, 213
in marriage, 215–16
Privileges and Immunities Clause, 13, 14, 39, 72, 105, 252, 342, 367
and jury trial, right to, 229
and state versus United States citizenship, 426–32
Procedural Due Process, 16–17, 18, 80, 160, 164
Prominent features, of the Constitution, 106–10
and original understanding, 106–107
Property rights. See also Reliance interest
"Public Forum" doctrine, 144–46, 335–36
Public function doctrine, 225
Public official plaintiff in libel cases, 438–37
Public trial guarantee
Gannett v. DePasquale, 232
Richmond Newspapers v. Virginia, 232–33
Punishment. See Cruel and unusual punishment provision
Punitive damages
disproportionality and, 390–91
fairness and, 389–92
historical standards and, 390–91
jurisdictional comparative approach and, 390
legal standards and, 390
reasonable analysis and, 390
Purpose
Constitutional, and structure, 182–83
freedom of speech and, 292–95
market participant doctrine and, 294–95
public access to criminal trials and, 294
racial gerrymandering and, 294
right of association and, 292–93
Purpose-based analysis, 515–16
Qualified privilege in United States v. Nixon, 195
Racial classification, 406
Racial discrimination
racial classifications and, 240–41, 363–67, 335, 364
segregation, 39–40. See also School desegregation
in Washington v. Davis, 228
Racial segregation, 39–40. See also School desegregation
Ratification of Constitution and Amendments, 76–79
absence of discussion, meaning of, 88–89
conventions for understanding of Constitution at, 59
debates at state conventions as citation material, 86
understanding during, 85–88
Ratifying generation. See Framing generation
Reliance interest
and abortion, 247
and Establishment Clause, 248
in homosexuality laws, 247–48
and judicial analytical methodology, 246
Lopez, United States v., 246–47
Religion Clauses
drafting of, as source for original understanding, 81
"Memorial and Remonstrance" (Madison) as antecedent of, 76–77
Reynolds v. United States, 75
tradition and practice in deciding cases involving, 133–34
the Virginia experience and 75–76. See also Bill of Religious Liberty (Virginia)
Religion, constitutional definition, 31–34
Religious Acknowledgment, 101–102, 140, 141–42
Religious practice
and Establishment Clause, 142
religious acknowledgment in American history, 140–41
religious monuments on public property, 141–42
school prayer, 143–44
Sunday closing laws, 142–43
tax exemptions, 143
Revisionist history, 122–23
Rhetorical arguments, 420. See also Rhetoric in constitutional interpretation
Rhetoric in constitutional interpretation
to bolster principle, 399–400
People's Rhetoric in Whalen v. California, 402–404
colorful, 415–16
common sense, 403
defined, 399
in dissent, 411–12
emotional appeal of, 405
to emphasize strength of conviction, 405–406
enduring nature of, 406–408
the First Amendment and, 400
Holmes's rhetoric in Schenck v. United States, 400–401
impact on law, 405
ineffective, 412–14
Jackson's rhetoric in West Virginia Board of Education v. Barnette, 404–405
metaphor as rhetorical device, 409–11
misleading, 402
oppositional, 414–15
precision and logic, 404
Right to bear arms, constitutional definition, 35
Right to counsel, constitutional definition, 35
Right to privacy. See Privacy protection
Right to review, Supreme Court's, 37
Right to travel, constitutional, 190, 342, 356
INDEX


and death penalty. 163–64
and Equal Protection. 164–65
and Establishment Clause. 102–103
and Second Amendment. 93–94, 112–13
and Sixth Amendment. 29–30
as textualism advocate. 4

School desegregation. 366
and "all deliberate speed." 287–88
and Equal Protection Clause. 39–40
and legal presumption. 330–31
and original understanding. 124–25
separate but equal. 244–45

School prayer. 61, 128, 143–44, 274, 437

Second Amendment. 33, 35–36, 66, 71, 85, 93, 95, 112–13, 253

District of Columbia v. Heller, 253–54

Sedition Act. 104

Seditious speech, and doctrinal development. 278–81

Segregation, racial. Plessy v. Ferguson, 244–45
Sentence length. 48
comparative analysis and. 386–88
disproportionate. 386–88
Harmelin v. Michigan and. 387–88
life imprisonment. 386–88
proportionality analysis and. 386–88
Rummel v. Estelle and. 386–87
Solem v. Helm and. 387–88
Separate but equal principle in public education. 246
Separation of church and state. 437–43
separationist approach at precedent. 441
Separation of powers
and congressional practice. 137–39
and executive practice. 138
Youngstown Sheet and Tube Co. v. Sawyer, 138

shall, constitutional definition. 32

Sixth Amendment. 365
definition of accused. 50–51
jury size issues and the. 17–18
right to counsel. 35
when public trial guarantee of, is inappropriate. 302–33

Slaughterhouse Cases
Civil Rights Act of 1866. 248
English common law forbidding monopolies. 456–62

Fourteenth Amendment and. 427–28, 429
impact on constitutional law. 425–26
as narrow construction example. 9
and original understanding. 73

Souter, Justice David Hackett. 53, 90, 102, 107, 109, 119, 122–23, 131, 141, 151–52, 157, 179, 201, 229, 254, 366, 439–40

Sovereign immunity
data versus holding in Seminole Tribe of Florida v. Florida. 229–30
origins of. 229

Sojourner, federal versus state. 197–98

Speech and Debate Clause. 47–48, 65, 89, 105–6, 110, 175
Speech and Debate Privilege, modeled on English Bill of Rights. 62

Speedy Trial Guarantee, and original understanding. 71

Standards of review. 246

Equal Protection Clause. 282–85
gender discrimination. 347–49
strict scrutiny. 281–82

Stare decisis
arguments for. 237–38
limitations of. 238–39
and Roe v. Wade. 239–40


State bias, and federal court jurisdiction. 11
State citizenship. 126–27
prerogatives and immunities of. 427–32
State, constitutional definition. 19, 32
Fourteenth Amendment applied to the. 225–26

State court, interpretation of constitution, reversing. 420

State custom, long standing as tradition. 478–90

State educational policies and First Amendment. 254

State sovereignty-based compact theory. 423

Stevens, Justice John Paul. 33, 66, 85, 94, 95, 103, 179, 197, 219, 364, 365, 362, 390, 410
on interpreting ambiguous use of "sole." 20
and reliance on tradition. 166–66
and Second Amendment. 33–36

Stewart, Justice Potter. 43, 65, 140
Stone, Justice Harlan Fiske. 185–86, 238, 282
Story, Justice Joseph. 31, 36–37, 72, 86, 100, 109, 128, 171, 363
author of foundational constitutional decisions. 5

Commentaries on the Constitution. 110–11
on plain meaning in Constitutional text, 11–12
right to counsel in Commentaries by, 433
state bias assumption, 11
textual arguments in Martin v. Hunter’s Lessee, 18–19
Structural arguments, 42, 420
Cohen v. Virginia, 424
and competing structural arguments, 196–202
and conception of federal power, 192
and constitutional rights, 190–91
contrasting the Constitution with other legal systems, 183–84
deriving, 177–79
doceine and, 170
effect on constitutional law, 186
to expand judicial review, 188–89
judicial review and, 184, 188–89
manipulation of, 201–202
Marbury v. Madison decision as prime example of, 3
original understanding and, 170
political safeguards theory, 184–87
precedent and, 170
purer form of, 181
purpose of structural provisions, 182–83
sources of, 179
subject to manipulation, 196, 202
vague, 201–202
See also Methods of interpretation
Structuralism. See Structural arguments;
Structural reasoning
Structural reasoning
Aiken v. Maine, 180, 199–200
Big Picture structure, 173–77
Carbone Products, United States v., 186
in civil liberties case, 190–91
and constitutional rights, 190–91
defined, 169
Eleventh Amendment Cases and structure alone, 179–82
foundational cases, 169
to justify judicial review, 184
to limit judicial review, 188–89
Martin v. Hunter’s Lessee, 171
McCalloch v. Maryland, 171–73, 198–99, 200–201
Myers v. United States and, 191–93
nature of, 169–70
Necessary and Proper Clause and, 172
obscenity, use in area of, 485n16
other sources, combined with, 181
presidential appointments/removals and, 191–92
problems with, as interpretive methodology, 196–202
role in constitutional law, 169
and separation of powers, 191–96
waiving of protection by state, 183
Youngstown Sheet and Tube v. Sawyer and, 194–94
See also Structural arguments
Structure, 296–96
and textualism, 296
Structure and Relationship to Constitutional Law
(Black), 169
Substantive Due Process, 98, 149–55, 156–58,
163, 176, 177, 213–14, 242–43, 247–48, 257,
302, 312–13, 353, 367, 368, 392–95
liberty and level of generality, 198
liberty and tradition, 149–54
tradition-based analysis of, 150, 151
Summary
Fourth Amendment and, 300–301
Necessary and Proper Clause and, 300
Supreme Court
appellate jurisdiction of the, 419–25
classification of cases of, 329–42
doctrinal framework of, 145, 330
equal protection jurisprudence, 339
Synthesis, 419–43
Takings Clause, 29, 39, 314, 326
original understanding of, 70, 233
Taxpayer standing, 49, 117, 241–42, 248, 362
to challenge federal spending program, 234–35
Hen v. Freedom from Religion
Foundation, 236
Term limits, 86–87, 97, 196–99
Tests for assessing constitutionality. See
Constitutionality tests
Textual analysis. See Textualism; Textual
understanding
Textual approach. See Textualism; Textual
understanding
Textual coherence. See Congruence, textual
Textualism
allure of, 2–5
ambiguous language and multiple
meanings, 16–23
canons of. See Basic canons of textualism
constitutional text, absence of, 51–52
constitutional text, disregarding, 53–54
defined, 1
flexibility of language and, 7–10
Textualism (Cont'd)
the Marshall Court and, 5
multiple word meanings and, 19–21
and other interpretation methods, 1–2
plain meaning of Constitutional text and, 10–14
Textual understanding, 438
Theory, 299–300
The people, constitutional definition, 32
Thomas, Justice Clarence
and Commerce Clause, 29
defining Commerce, 94
dissenting in United States v. Virginia, 178–79
dissenting in Kelo v. City of New London, 29, 70, 94
dissenting in Texas v. Granville, 72
and “fundamental rights,” 105
on “Memorial and Remonstrance” of Madison, 107
and “Public Use” Clause, 29
and redundancy argument, 22–23
Tradition
defined in, 164
evaluating, 165–66
and incorporation, 147–49
length of, in Establishment Clause, 148
and level of generality, 155–58
significance of in Bowers v. Hardwick, 152
and substantive due process liberty, 149–54
Tearning v. New Jersey, 147–48
Tradition and practice. See also Practice:
Religious practice, 133
change, decline, and absence of, 161–62
defined, 133
and the Due Process Clause, 147
due process, defining by, 134
Establishment Clause, interpretation of, 140
and family life, protected by due process liberty, 479n111
fundamental fairness approach and, 147, 148
generality, level of, 155–58
as methodology, 133–37
and original understanding, 133
religion and, 140–44
school prayer, 143–44
Twelfth Amendment, 51
Underlying predicates, rejection of, 242–44
Agostini v. Felton, 243
and guarantee against unreasonable searches and seizures, 243–44
Unique precedent, 219–21
Bush v. Gore, 221
Pentagon Papers Case, 221
Watergate investigation, 220–21
Unsourced original understanding, 113–14
U.S. citizenship, 426–27
Privileges or Immunities Clause, 427–32
Vesting clauses, 31–32
Wall of separation (between Church and State), 409–11
conclusion, and Hugo Black, 116
Establishment Clause and, 116, 271–74
Warren, Chief Justice Earl, 359, 373
and Cruel and Unusual Punishment Clause, 23
and McGowan v. Maryland, 77–78, 81
and Prop v. Dallas, 164
Watergate investigation, Nixon, United States v., 220–21
Weight of precedent, Twinning v. New Jersey, 225
White, Justice Byron, 68, 82, 95, 110, 163, 286–87
Whole cloth
abortion and, 302–303
deporatation and, 304–305
due process liberty and, 302
ex post facto laws and, 301
First Amendment and, 303–304
Fourteenth Amendment and, 303–304
freedom of speech and, 303–304
government regulation and, 303–304
liberty of contract and, 302
medical treatment and, 302
right to counsel and, 303, 305
Sixth Amendment and, 305